

# VU Research Portal

## Charting the Uncharted Waters: Non-Contractual Liabilities for Damage Caused by GNSS-Enabled Artificial Intelligence

Bratu, Ioana

2024

**DOI (link to publisher)**  
[10.5463/thesis.396](https://doi.org/10.5463/thesis.396)

### **document version**

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

### **citation for published version (APA)**

Bratu, I. (2024). *Charting the Uncharted Waters: Non-Contractual Liabilities for Damage Caused by GNSS-Enabled Artificial Intelligence: Legal Challenges in International Space Law and European Tort Law*. [PhD-Thesis - Research and graduation internal, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam]. <https://doi.org/10.5463/thesis.396>

### **General rights**

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

### **Take down policy**

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

### **E-mail address:**

[vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl](mailto:vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl)

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABBREVIATIONS	15
MAJOR SPACE TREATIES	16
LEGISLATIVE PROPOSALS ON ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE	17
RELEVANT PUBLICATIONS	18

## Chapter 1

---

<b>INTRODUCTION</b>	<b>19</b>
1.1 ALL WE NEED IS SPACE: UNDERSTANDING THE CRITICAL ROLE OF SATELLITE TECHNOLOGY	19
1.2 WHEN NAVIGATION MEETS INTELLIGENCE: THE GNSS-POWERED AI REVOLUTION	21
1.3 LIABILITY IN TURBULENT SKIES: NAVIGATING THE CONSEQUENCES OF GNSS MALFUNCTIONS	22
1.4 PURPOSE OF THE RESEARCH	23
1.5 RESEARCH QUESTIONS	24
1.6 WORKING SCENARIOS	25
Scenario 1	25
Scenario 2	25
Scenario 3	26
1.7 METHODOLOGY	27
1.8 LIMITATIONS AND INSIGHTS	28
1.9 STRUCTURE OF THE THESIS	30

## Chapter 2

---

<b>DEMYSTIFYING ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE: OVERVIEW, APPLICATIONS, AND CAUSES OF MALFUNCTIONS</b>	<b>31</b>
2.1 INTRODUCTION	31
2.2 CHARTING A COURSE THROUGH DISRUPTION: THE BASICS OF ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE	32
2.2.1 A Brief History of Intelligent Machines	32
2.2.2 Symbolic, Data-Driven and General Artificial Intelligence	34
2.2.3 From Earth to Space: Deploying Artificial Intelligence in Space-Related Activities	36
2.3 FRAMING ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE VIA ITS UNIQUE CHARACTERISTICS	38
2.3.1 Autonomy	39
2.3.2 Learning Capacity	40
2.3.3 Complexity and Interdependency	41

2.3.4	Opacity	41
2.4	ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE IN EUROPE: ENABLING TRUST FOR OUR DIGITAL LIVES VIA THE AI ACT	42
2.4.1	The European Approach to Defining “Artificial Intelligence”	43
2.4.2	The European Classification of Artificial Intelligence	45
2.4.2.1	Prohibited AI systems	45
2.4.2.2	High-risk AI systems	45
2.4.2.3	Limited and minimal risk AI systems	48
2.4.2.4	General-purpose AI	48
2.4.3	The Peculiar Case of GNSS-Enabled AI: Prohibited, High-Risk or Other Type of AI Systems?	49
2.5	SAILING THROUGH ROUGH WATERS: SOURCES OF ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE MALFUNCTIONS	52
2.5.1	Intentional and Unintentional Threats	52
2.5.2	The Role of GNSS in the Operation of AI Systems	54
2.6	CONCLUSIONS	56

### **Chapter 3**

---

	<b>GLOBAL NAVIGATION SATELLITE SYSTEMS AS A TECHNOLOGICAL MARVEL: OVERVIEW, APPLICATIONS, AND CAUSES OF MALFUNCTIONS</b>	<b>57</b>
3.1	INTRODUCTION	57
3.2	LIVING THE DREAM: AN INTRODUCTION TO GNSS CAPABILITIES	58
3.2.1	A Brief History of GNSS	58
3.2.2	Basic Technical Overview	60
3.2.2.1	GNSS segments	60
3.2.2.2	GNSS signals and service provision	62
3.3	EUROPE’S NAVIGATION REVOLUTION TAKES FLIGHT WITH GALILEO	64
3.3.1	Galileo Management Structure	65
3.3.2	Galileo Signals and Service Provision	67
3.4	SATELLITE-DRIVEN SYNERGY: EXAMPLES OF GNSS-ENABLED AI	69
3.4.1	Road Traffic	70
3.4.2	Aviation	73
3.4.3	Maritime Transport	74
3.4.4	Precision Agriculture	74
3.5	NAVIGATING THROUGH TROUBLE: SOURCES OF GNSS MALFUNCTIONS	75
3.5.1	Electronic Interferences	77
3.5.1.1	Intentional electronic interferences	77

3.5.1.2	Unintentional electronic interferences and other technical malfunctions	80
3.5.2	Kinetic Interferences	81
3.6	CONCLUSIONS	83

## **Chapter 4**

---

<b>AN ODYSSEY ENDEAVOR: DEFINING NON-CONTRACTUAL LIABILITY</b>		<b>85</b>
4.1	INTRODUCTION	85
4.2	NAVIGATING THE TERMINOLOGICAL TRICHOTOMY: FROM ACCOUNTABILITY TO RESPONSIBILITY AND LIABILITY	86
4.3	FRAMING THE CONCEPT OF CIVIL LIABILITY	89
4.3.1	Contractual Versus Non-Contractual Liability	89
4.3.2	Legal Grounds of Non-Contractual Liability: Fault and Strict Liability Regimes	90
4.4	AN INVENTORY OF THE KEY ELEMENTS COMPOSING NON-CONTRACTUAL LIABILITY	92
4.4.1	Illegal Acts	92
4.4.2	Fault and Negligence	93
4.4.3	Damage	94
4.4.4	Causation	96
4.4.5	Compensation	97
4.5	THE ADVENT OF RISK-BASED NON-CONTRACTUAL LIABILITY	98
4.5.1	The Bright and the Dark Sides of Risk-Based Frameworks	99
4.5.2	Elements of Risk-Based Frameworks	101
4.6	CONCLUSIONS	102

## **Chapter 5**

---

<b>A LEGAL TURMOIL: DEFINING NON-CONTRACTUAL LIABILITY IN A GNSS CONTEXT</b>		<b>103</b>
5.1	INTRODUCTION	103
5.2	EXPLORING THE CONUNDRUM OF GNSS GOVERNANCE	104
5.3	THE CHARTED WATERS: INITIAL APPROACHES TO GNSS LIABILITY	107
5.3.1	ICAO	108
5.3.2	UNIDROIT	109
5.4	UTOPIA MEETS REALITY: THE EUROPEAN APPROACH TO GNSS LIABILITY	111
5.4.1	European Proposals for GNSS Governance and Liability Presented Part of ICAO	112
5.4.2	The Absence of Clear GNSS Liability Provisions in the EU Policy	113

5.5	TOWARDS A WHITE WHALE QUEST: APPLYING THE INVENTORY OF LIABILITY IN A GNSS CONTEXT	115
5.5.1	Open Signals and Disclaimers of Liability	115
5.5.2	GNSS Cross-Border Damage	117
5.5.2.1	Damage occurring on the EU territory: applicable law	117
5.5.2.2	Damage occurring outside the EU territory: the problem of (foreign) state immunity and lessons learned from the United States	122
5.5.3	Multifaceted Causal Links	124
5.5.4	The Problem of “Many Hands” in a GNSS Context	124
5.6	CONCLUSIONS	126

## **Chapter 6**

---

	<b>AN EVER-EVOLVING TERRAIN: THE LEGAL LANDSCAPE OF GNSS-RELATED DAMAGE IN INTERNATIONAL SPACE LAW</b>	<b>129</b>
6.1	INTRODUCTION	129
6.2	THE PICTURE-PERFECT TRUTH: RELEVANCE OF CORPUS JURIS SPATIALIS FOR GNSS	130
6.3	A KAFKAESQUE MAZE: NAVIGATING LIABILITY UNDER CORPUS JURIS SPATIALIS	131
6.3.1	Provisions Representing Customary International Law	132
6.3.2	International Responsibility: An Alternative to International Liability?	135
6.3.3	A Dual Regime: Absolute and Fault-Based Liability for Third-Party Claims	137
6.4	A POSSIBLE STAIRWAY TO HEAVEN: APPLYING THE INVENTORY OF LIABILITY IN THE CONTEXT OF CORPUS JURIS SPATIALIS	139
6.4.1	GNSS Signals and the Notion of “Space Object”	139
6.4.1.1	Schools of thought related to the term “space object”	140
6.4.1.2	Observations on the component part	142
6.4.1.3	Interpretation rules for defining “space object”	142
6.4.1.4	Relevance of the term “launch”	145
6.4.1.5	Towards a new definition for “space object”	146
6.4.2	GNSS “Damage”	147
6.4.2.1	Schools of thought for interpreting the term “damage”	148
6.4.2.2	Interpretation rules for the definition of “damage”	150
6.4.3	The Link Between Space Objects and Damage: Causation	153
6.5	CONCLUSIONS	154

## Chapter 7

---

<b>THE UNCHARTED WATERS: EUROPEAN TORT LAW AND DAMAGE CAUSED BY GNSS-ENABLED AI</b>	<b>157</b>
7.1 INTRODUCTION	157
7.2 THE EUROPEAN RISK-BASED APPROACH TO DAMAGE CAUSED BY GNSS-ENABLED AI	158
7.2.1 European Initiatives in the Field of AI Liability	158
7.2.2 The Commission’s Dual-Track Strategy: Fault and Strict Liability Regimes	161
7.3 A BRIDGE TO NOWHERE: APPLYING THE INVENTORY OF LIABILITY TO THE AI LIABILITY DIRECTIVE	165
7.3.1 Unclear Legal Status of GNSS-Enabled AI	165
7.3.2 Enabling Transparency via Disclosure of Evidence	166
7.3.3 A New Approach to Causation via Targeted Harmonization	167
7.3.3.1 Essential conditions leading to the presumption of causality	168
7.3.3.2 Types of claims	170
7.3.4 Conclusions on the Applicability of the AI Liability Directive to Damage Caused by GNSS-Enabled AI	172
7.4 A CLOUD WITH A SILVER LINING: APPLYING THE INVENTORY OF LIABILITY TO THE NEW PRODUCT LIABILITY DIRECTIVE	174
7.4.1 Tangibles Versus Intangibles and Their Defectiveness Under Directive 85/374	176
7.4.2 The Classification of GNSS-Enabled AI as “Products”: A Step into the Right Direction	178
7.4.3 A New Approach to Defectiveness and Development Risk Defence in Line with the Characteristics of AI Systems	179
7.4.4 A New Category of Actors Among the Existing “Many Hands”	180
7.4.5 Enabling Transparency via Disclosure of Evidence	181
7.4.6 Essential Conditions Leading to Presumptions of Defectiveness and Causality	182
Step 1. Proving defectiveness	182
Step 2. Assuming causality based on proven defectiveness	183
Step 3. The exception involving “excessive difficulties”	183
Step 4. Rebuttal	184
7.4.7 A Definition for “Damage” (Un)fit for the Digital Age	184
7.4.8 Conclusions on the Applicability of the New Product Liability Directive to Damage Caused by GNSS-Enabled AI	185
7.5 PROPOSALS FOR IMPROVING THE COMMISSION’S APPROACH TO AI LIABILITY	187

## **Chapter 8**

---

<b>CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	189
8.1 REVISITING THE RESEARCH AIM, QUESTIONS, AND METHODOLOGY	189
8.2 MAIN ARGUMENTS USED IN CONNECTION WITH THE RESEARCH AIM	191
What are AI systems?	191
What are GNSS and GNSS-enabled AI systems?	191
What is non-contractual liability?	192
What is non-contractual liability in a GNSS context?	192
How is international space law applicable to damage caused by GNSS-enabled AI at an upstream level?	194
How is EU non-contractual liability applicable to damage caused by GNSS-enabled AI at a downstream level?	195
8.3 FURTHER RESEARCH QUESTIONS	196
THESIS SUMMARY	199
BIBLIOGRAPHY	205